arXiv:gr-qc/0601040v2 14 Apr 2006

Tilted Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies – the radiation bifurcation

W C Lim[1,2], R J Deeley[1,3] and J Wainwright[1]

[1] Department of Applied Mathematics, University of Waterloo,
Waterloo, Ontario, Canada N2L 3G1
[2] Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Dalhousie University,
Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada B3H 3J5
[3] Department of Mathematics and Statistics, University of Victoria, Victoria, British
Columbia, Canada V8W 3P4

Email: wclim@mathstat.dal.ca, rjdeeley@math.uvic.ca, jwainwri@math.uwaterloo.ca

Abstract

We derive the late-time behaviour of tilted Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies with an irrotational radiation fluid as source, and give the asymptotic form of the general solution as $t \to +\infty$, making comparisons with the dust-filled models. At first sight the radiation-filled models appear to approximate the flat FL model at late times, since the Hubble-normalized shear and the tilt tend to zero and the density parameter tends to one. The Hubble-normalized Weyl curvature diverges, however, indicating that physically significant anisotropy remains. We also discuss the influence of a cosmological constant on this phenomenon.

1 Introduction

The evolution of spatially homogeneous cosmologies of Bianchi type VII$_0$ with a non-tilted perfect fluid source and zero cosmological constant has recently been shown to exhibit a number of new and interesting features at late times (see Wainwright *et al* 1999 and Nilsson *et al* 2000)[1] Firstly, they exhibit the *breaking of asymptotic self-similarity*, and thus serve as counter-examples to the hope that any Bianchi universe is approximated at late times by an exact self-similar Bianchi universe (see WHU, pages 2578–2579).

The breaking of asymptotic self-similarity is characterized by oscillations in the Hubble-normalized shear that become increasingly rapid in terms of the cosmological clock time t as $t \to +\infty$. Depending on the equation of state, this behaviour also leads to *Weyl curvature dominance*, which refers to the fact that Hubble-normalized scalars formed from the Weyl curvature tensor become unbounded as $t \to +\infty$ (see WHU, page 2588).

Asymptotic self-similarity breaking also has interesting implications as regards isotropization. In a spatially homogeneous cosmology, there are two physical manifestations of anisotropy:

(a) the shear of the timelike congruence that represents the large-scale distribution of the matter;

(b) the Weyl curvature, which can be viewed as describing the intrinsic anisotropy in the gravitational field: it determines up to four preferred directions, the principal null directions of the gravitational field.

---

[1] From now on we will refer to these papers as WHU and NHW respectively.

The dynamical significance of these anisotropies can be quantified by normalizing the shear tensor and the Weyl curvature tensor with the Hubble scalar, and defining two scalars, the *shear parameter* Σ and the *Weyl parameters* $\mathcal{W}_1$, $\mathcal{W}_2$ (see Section 4 for the definitions).[2]

Bianchi I cosmologies isotropize for all values of the equation of state parameter $\gamma - 1 = p/\rho$, i.e. $0 < \gamma < 2$, in the sense that $\Sigma \to 0$ and $\mathcal{W}_1, \mathcal{W}_2 \to 0$ as $t \to +\infty$. Indeed these models are asymptotically self-similar, and the asymptotic state is the flat Friedmann-Lemaître (FL) model. On the other hand, for the class of Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies the value $\gamma = \frac{4}{3}$, corresponding to a radiation fluid, acts as a *bifurcation value* as regards isotropization: if $\gamma \leq \frac{4}{3}$, the shear parameter $\Sigma \to 0$ as $t \to +\infty$, while if $\frac{4}{3} < \gamma < 2$, Σ oscillates indefinitely away from zero, and does not approach a limit (see WHU, page 2581). In addition, the isotropization that occurs in the case $1 \leq \gamma \leq \frac{4}{3}$ differs significantly from the isotropization that occurs in Bianchi I cosmologies, due to the previously mentioned phenomenon of Weyl curvature dominance. Specifically, in Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies, if $\gamma = 1$, the Weyl scalars $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ are bounded but do not tend to zero as $t \to +\infty$, while if $1 < \gamma \leq \frac{4}{3}$, $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ are unbounded as $t \to +\infty$ (see WHU, page 2581). We say that shear isotropization occurs if $\gamma \leq \frac{4}{3}$, but that Weyl isotropization does not.

More recently, Coley & Hervik 2005 have investigated the effect of tilt on the dynamics of Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies at late times. In general tilted Bianchi cosmologies have three additional degrees of freedom which describe the orientation of the fluid four-velocity relative to the normal to the group orbits (see King & Ellis 1973). For simplicity Coley & Hervik restricted their attention to models with one tilt degree of freedom. They found that the value $\gamma = \frac{4}{3}$ of the equation of state parameter acts as a bifurcation value as regards the tilt: if $\gamma \leq \frac{4}{3}$, the tilt variable tends to zero as $t \to +\infty$ and the model undergoes shear isotropization as in the non-tilted case, while if $\frac{4}{3} < \gamma < 2$, the tilt variable does not tend to zero as $t \to +\infty$. The analysis of Coley & Hervik does not include models with $\gamma = \frac{4}{3}$, the bifurcation value. Our first goal in this paper is to give a proof of the asymptotic behaviour of this class of cosmologies, i.e. the radiation-filled Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies with one tilt degree of freedom. Our second goal is to give the asymptotic decay rates as $t \to +\infty$ for the various physical quantities.

The outline of the paper is as follows. In Section 2 we present the evolution equations for Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies with a tilted irrotational perfect fluid. In Section 3 we establish the limits of the dimensionless gravitational field and matter variables at late times for the case of a radiation fluid with zero cosmological constant. Section 4 concerns the question of isotropization at late times. Section 5 presents the asymptotic form of the solutions. Section 6 considers the effect of a positive cosmological constant on the results of the previous sections. We conclude in Section 7 with a discussion of the implications of the results. The details of the proof for the limits are given in Appendix A. The derivation of the asymptotic forms is given in Appendix B.

2 The evolution equations

As in previous recent investigations of Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies (see WHU, NHW, Coley and Hervik 2005), we write the Einstein field equations using Hubble-normalized variables within the framework of the orthonormal frame formalism of Ellis and MacCallum 1969, in which the commutation functions $\gamma^c{}_{ab}$ of the orthonormal frame $\{\mathbf{e}_a\}$, defined by

---

[2] We shall use $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ in this paper instead of $\mathcal{W}$ as in WHU and NWH because $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ are spacetime scalars while $\mathcal{W}$ is defined with respect to the congruence, and hence is not a spacetime scalar.

$$[\mathbf{e}_a,\ \mathbf{e}_b] = \gamma^c{}_{ab}\mathbf{e}_c\ ,$$

act as the basic variables of the gravitational field.[3] We choose the frame to be invariant under the isometry group G_3, and $\mathbf{e}_0 = \mathbf{n}$, the unit normal to the group orbits. It follows that $\gamma^c{}_{ab}$ depends only on t, the clock time along $\mathbf{e}_0$. The non-zero components of the commutation functions are (see Wainwright and Ellis, page 39)

$$\{H, \sigma_{\alpha\beta}, n_{\alpha\beta}, a_\alpha, \Omega_\alpha\}\ .$$

The variable H is the Hubble scalar, $\sigma_{\alpha\beta}$ is the rate of shear tensor, $n_{\alpha\beta}$ and a_α describe the spatial curvature, and Ω_α is the local angular velocity of the spatial frame $\{\mathbf{e}_\alpha\}$ with respect to a Fermi-propagated spatial frame. The energy-momentum tensor in the case of a tilted perfect fluid is

$$T_{ab} = \tilde{\rho} u_a u_b + \tilde{p}(g_{ab} + u_a u_b)\ ,$$

and we assume linear equation of state $\tilde{p} = (\gamma - 1)\tilde{\rho}$. The fluid 4-velocity $\mathbf{u}$ is written in the form

$$u^a = \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 - v_b v^b}}(n^a + v^a)\ ,$$

where the spacelike vector $\mathbf{v}$ is orthogonal to $\mathbf{n}$, and satisfies $0 \leq v_b v^b < 1$. The vector $\mathbf{v}$ is called the *tilt vector* of the fluid. It has components $(0, v^\alpha)$ relative to the orthonormal frame $\{\mathbf{n}, \mathbf{e}_\alpha\}$. Writing the energy-momentum tensor in the form

$$T_{ab} = \rho n_a n_b + 2q_{(a}n_{b)} + p(g_{ab} + n_a n_b) + \pi_{ab}\ ,$$

the source terms $(\rho, p, q_\alpha, \pi_{\alpha\beta})$ can be expressed in terms of ρ and v_α (see Appendix A of Hewitt *et al* 2001). The Hubble-normalized commutation functions and the density paramter Ω are defined by

$$(\Sigma_{\alpha\beta}, N_{\alpha\beta}, A_\alpha, R_\alpha) = (\sigma_{\alpha\beta}, n_{\alpha\beta}, a_\alpha, \Omega_\alpha)/H\ , \quad \Omega = \rho/(3H^2)\ . \tag{1}$$

We introduce the usual dimensionless time variable τ according to

$$\frac{dt}{d\tau} = \frac{1}{H}\ . \tag{2}$$

For more details, see Appendix A of Hewitt *et al* 2001.

For the class of Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies with a tilted perfect fluid, we have $A_\alpha = 0$, and one of the eigenvalues of $N_{\alpha\beta}$ is zero. We choose the spatial frame $\{\mathbf{e}_\alpha\}$ so that $\mathbf{e}_1$ is the corresponding eigenvector. It then follows that

$$N_{1\alpha} = 0\ , \tag{3}$$

and the evolution equations of the $N_{1\alpha}$ (Hewitt *et al* 2001, equation (A.12)) imply

$$R_2 = \Sigma_{13}\ , \quad R_3 = -\Sigma_{12}\ . \tag{4}$$

---

[3] Indices are with respect to the basis of the frame vectors instead of the coordinate basis; lower case Latin indices run from 0 to 3; Greek indices from 1 to 3; upper case Latin indices from 2 to 3.

We next impose the restriction that the perfect fluid is *irrotational*, which is equivalent to[4] setting

$$v_2 = v_3 = 0 = \Sigma_{12} = \Sigma_{13} \ . \tag{5}$$

We now label the shear variables $\Sigma_{\alpha\beta}$ and the spatial curvature variables $N_{\alpha\beta}$ as follows

$$(\Sigma_{\alpha\beta}) = \begin{pmatrix} -2\Sigma_+ & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & \Sigma_+ + \sqrt{3}\Sigma_- & \sqrt{3}\Sigma_\times \\ 0 & \sqrt{3}\Sigma_\times & \Sigma_+ - \sqrt{3}\Sigma_- \end{pmatrix} \ , \quad (N_{\alpha\beta}) = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & N_+ + \sqrt{3}N_- & \sqrt{3}N_\times \\ 0 & \sqrt{3}N_\times & N_+ - \sqrt{3}N_- \end{pmatrix} \ , \tag{6}$$

and also drop the index on v_1 and R_1.

With these restrictions, the general evolution equations (A.11)–(A.13) and (A.29) in Hewitt *et al* 2001 reduce to the following system of differential equations:

$$\begin{aligned} \Sigma_+' &= (q-2)\Sigma_+ - 2(N_-^2 + N_\times^2) - G_+^{-1}\gamma\Omega v^2 && (7) \\ \Sigma_-' &= (q-2)\Sigma_- - 2R\Sigma_\times - 2N_+N_- && (8) \\ \Sigma_\times' &= (q-2)\Sigma_\times + 2R\Sigma_- - 2N_+N_\times && (9) \\ N_+' &= (q+2\Sigma_+)N_+ + 6\Sigma_-N_- + 6\Sigma_\times N_\times && (10) \\ N_-' &= (q+2\Sigma_+)N_- - 2RN_\times + 2N_+\Sigma_- && (11) \\ N_\times' &= (q+2\Sigma_+)N_\times + 2RN_- + 2N_+\Sigma_\times && (12) \\ v' &= G_-^{-1}\big[(3\gamma-4) + 2\Sigma_+\big](1-v^2)v \ , && (13) \end{aligned}$$

where

$$G_\pm = 1 \pm (\gamma-1)v^2 \ .$$

The density parameter Ω is given by

$$\Omega = 1 - \Sigma_+^2 - \Sigma_-^2 - \Sigma_\times^2 - N_-^2 - N_\times^2 \geq 0 \ , \tag{14}$$

and the deceleration parameter q is given by

$$q = 2(\Sigma_+^2 + \Sigma_-^2 + \Sigma_\times^2) + \tfrac{1}{2}G_+^{-1}[(3\gamma-2) + (2-\gamma)v^2]\Omega \ . \tag{15}$$

There is one constraint left from (A.27) of Hewitt *et al* 2001:

$$0 = 2(\Sigma_-N_\times - \Sigma_\times N_-) + G_+^{-1}\gamma\Omega v \ . \tag{16}$$

The evolution equation (A.28) of Hewitt *et al* 2001 for Ω simplifies to

$$\Omega' = \big[2q - G_+^{-1}[(3\gamma-2) + (2-\gamma)v^2] + 2G_+^{-1}\gamma\Sigma_+v^2\big]\,\Omega \ . \tag{17}$$

The variable R in equations (7)–(13), which describes the rate of which the spatial frame is rotating in the 23-space, is unrestricted. We will eliminate it by introducing rotation-invariant variables as in (20)–(22) below.

The inequality (14) implies that the variables Σ_+, Σ_-, $\Sigma_\times$, N_- and $N_\times$ are bounded. The remaining gravitational field variable, N_+, however, is not bounded. In fact, it has been shown (see equation (4.2) of Coley and Hervik 2005) that

---

[4] This result follows from the expressions for the fluid vorticity W_α in Hewitt *et al* 2001, Appendix C. See King & Ellis 1973 for the original result.

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} N_+ = \infty \tag{18}$$

for all initial states with $\Omega > 0$ and $\frac{2}{3} < \gamma < 2$. We thus introduce a new variable

$$M = \frac{1}{N_+} \ . \tag{19}$$

It can be seen from equations (8) & (11), and (9) & (12) that the unboundedness of N_+ leads to increasingly rapid oscillations in the pairs of variables (Σ_-, N_-) and $(\Sigma_\times, N_\times)$. We thus introduce an angular variable ψ and two rotation-invariant variables $\mathcal{R}_1$ and $\mathcal{R}_2$ as follows

$$\mathcal{R}_1 = \Sigma_-^2 + \Sigma_\times^2 + N_-^2 + N_\times^2 \tag{20}$$

$$\mathcal{R}_2 \cos 2\psi = \Sigma_-^2 + \Sigma_\times^2 - N_-^2 - N_\times^2 \tag{21}$$

$$\mathcal{R}_2 \sin 2\psi = 2(\Sigma_- N_- + \Sigma_\times N_\times) \ . \tag{22}$$

It follows from (20)–(22) that

$$\mathcal{R}_1^2 - \mathcal{R}_2^2 = 4(\Sigma_- N_\times - \Sigma_\times N_-)^2 \ . \tag{23}$$

The resulting evolution equations for the variables $(\Sigma_+, \mathcal{R}_1, \mathcal{R}_2, M, \psi, v)$ do not contain the variable R.

We note that the conditions

$$\Sigma_\times = 0 \ , \quad N_\times = 0 \ , \quad R = 0 \ , \tag{24}$$

which imply $v = 0$ on account of (16), describe the non-tilted models. With these restrictions equations (7)–(15) reduce to (3.7), (3.9) and (3.10) in WHU. In addition the angular variable ψ in (21) and (22) coincides with the angular variable ψ defined by equation (3.15) in WHU. This conclusion follows from noting that (24) implies $\mathcal{R}_1 = \mathcal{R}_2$ and that $\mathcal{R}_1 = R_{\mathrm{WHU}}^2$.

3 Limits for the radiation-filled case at late times

In this section we determine the limits of the variables

$$(\Sigma_+,\ \mathcal{R}_1,\ \mathcal{R}_2,\ M,\ \psi,\ v) \ . \tag{25}$$

for the case of a radiation fluid, given by

$$\gamma = \tfrac{4}{3} \ . \tag{26}$$

For this value of γ, the expression (15) for q simplifies to

$$q = 1 + \Sigma_+^2 + \mathcal{R}_2 \cos 2\psi \ , \tag{27}$$

on eliminating Ω using (14). In terms of the variables (25) the evolution equations (7)–(13) assume the form[5]

$$\Sigma_+' = -(1-\Sigma_+^2)\Sigma_+ - \mathcal{R}_1 + (1+\Sigma_+)\mathcal{R}_2\cos 2\psi - \frac{4\Omega v^2}{3+v^2} \tag{28}$$

$$\mathcal{R}_1' = 2\big[(1+\Sigma_+)\Sigma_+ + \mathcal{R}_2\cos 2\psi\big]\mathcal{R}_1 - 2(1+\Sigma_+)(\cos 2\psi)\mathcal{R}_2 \tag{29}$$

$$\mathcal{R}_2' = 2\big[(1+\Sigma_+)\Sigma_+ + \mathcal{R}_2\cos 2\psi\big]\mathcal{R}_2 - 2(1+\Sigma_+)(\cos 2\psi)\mathcal{R}_1 \tag{30}$$

$$M' = -[(1+\Sigma_+)^2 + \mathcal{R}_2\cos 2\psi + 3\mathcal{R}_2 M\sin 2\psi]M \tag{31}$$

$$\psi' = \tfrac{2}{M} + (1+\Sigma_+)\tfrac{\mathcal{R}_1}{\mathcal{R}_2}\sin 2\psi \tag{32}$$

$$v' = \tfrac{6}{3-v^2}\Sigma_+(1-v^2)v\ . \tag{33}$$

Using (23), the constraint (16) becomes

$$\mathcal{R}_1^2 - \mathcal{R}_2^2 - \left(\frac{4\Omega v}{3+v^2}\right)^2 = 0\ . \tag{34}$$

Equation (14) for the density parameter assumes the form

$$\Omega = 1 - \Sigma_+^2 - \mathcal{R}_1\ . \tag{35}$$

The evolution equation (17) for Ω becomes

$$\Omega' = 2\left[\Sigma_+^2 + \mathcal{R}_2\cos 2\psi + \frac{4v^2}{3+v^2}\Sigma_+\right]\Omega\ . \tag{36}$$

Observe that equations (28)–(36) are invariant under the interchange $v \to -v$, and that $v = 0$ is an invariant set. We can thus without loss of generality assume that $v > 0$ for tilted models. The above formulation of the evolution equations has one unsatisfactory feature, namely the presence of the term $\mathcal{R}_1/\mathcal{R}_2$ in the evolution equation (32) for ψ. By (20), $\mathcal{R}_1 \geq 0$ for all τ, and on account of (34), $\mathcal{R}_1 = 0$ for some τ is not possible since then $\Omega v = 0$, which is excluded for tilted matter-filled models. So $\mathcal{R}_1 > 0$ for all τ, i.e. $\mathcal{R}_1 = 0$ is an invariant set, in the boundary of the physical state space. On the other hand, $\mathcal{R}_2$ can become zero, in which case the change of variables (21)–(22) is singular and the evolution equations (28)–(33) break down. Numerical simulations using the evolution equations (7)–(13), however, provide evidence that for typical initial conditions $\mathcal{R}_2$ can become zero for at most a finite number of times. In other words for a typical choice of initial condition, there exists a time τ_0 such that $\mathcal{R}_2(\tau) > 0$ or $\mathcal{R}_2(\tau) < 0$ for all $\tau > \tau_0$. Note that the evolution equations (28)–(33) are invariant under the transformation $\psi \to \psi + \frac{\pi}{2}$ and $\mathcal{R}_2 \to -\mathcal{R}_2$. We make use of this symmetry to assume, without loss of generality, that $\mathcal{R}_2(\tau) > 0$ for all $\tau > \tau_0$. In other words, for typical initial conditions we expect that for τ sufficiently large, the transformation (20)–(22) will be non-singular, and the evolution equations (28)–(33) will be well-defined.

---

[5] These equations can also be obtained from the evolution equations (4.10)–(4.18) in Coley and Hervik 2005, by setting $\gamma = \frac{4}{3}$, and noting the following relation between our variables and theirs:

$$\mathcal{R}_1 = \sigma_1\ , \quad \mathcal{R}_2 = \rho\ , \quad 2\psi = \tfrac{\pi}{2} - \psi_{\rm CH}\ , \quad M = \tfrac{1}{\sqrt{3}}M_{\rm CH}\ .$$

The limit of M is

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} M = 0 \ , \tag{37}$$

which follows immediately from (18). Since ψ' in (32) is dominated by M^{-1}, the trigonometric functions in (28)–(33) will oscillate increasingly rapidly as $\tau \to +\infty$. In order to control these oscillations, we modify the variables Σ_+, $\mathcal{R}_1$, M, Z and Ω (in analogy with equations (17)–(21) in NHW) according to

$$\begin{aligned}
\bar{\Sigma}_+ &= \Sigma_+ - \tfrac{1}{4}M(1+\Sigma_+)\mathcal{R}_2 \sin 2\psi && (38)\\
\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1 &= \frac{\mathcal{R}_1}{1+\frac{1}{2}M(\mathcal{R}_1 - 1 - \Sigma_+)\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1}\sin 2\psi} && (39)\\
\bar{M} &= \frac{M}{1-\frac{1}{4}M\mathcal{R}_2 \sin 2\psi} && (40)\\
\bar{\Omega} &= \frac{\Omega}{1+\frac{1}{2}M\mathcal{R}_2 \sin 2\psi} \ . && (41)
\end{aligned}$$

It follows from (28), (29), (31), (35) and (36) that the evolution equations for the new variables have the form[6]

$$\begin{aligned}
\bar{\Sigma}'_+ &= -\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1 - \bar{\Sigma}_+(1-\bar{\Sigma}_+^2) - \frac{4}{3+v^2}(1-\bar{\Sigma}_+^2 - \bar{\mathcal{R}}_1)v^2 + MB_{\bar{\Sigma}_+} && (42)\\
\bar{\mathcal{R}}'_1 &= 2\left[\bar{\Sigma}_+ + \bar{\Sigma}_+^2 + MB_{\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1}\right]\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1 && (43)\\
\bar{M}' &= -\left[(1+\bar{\Sigma}_+)^2 + MB_{\bar{M}}\right]\bar{M} && (44)\\
\bar{\Omega}' &= 2\left[\bar{\Sigma}_+^2 + \frac{4\Sigma_+ v^2}{3+v^2} + M\mathcal{R}_1 B_{\bar{\Omega}}\right]\bar{\Omega} \ , && (45)
\end{aligned}$$

where the B's are bounded as $\tau \to +\infty$. Equations (42)–(45) depend explicitly on ψ through the B's which are all multiplied by a factor M. This fact, in conjunction with (37), implies that *the oscillatory terms in (42)–(45) tend to zero as* $\tau \to +\infty$. Observe that the variable $\mathcal{R}_2$ only appears in the B-terms, which means that it is not necessary to introduce an evolution equation for a modified variable $\bar{\mathcal{R}}_2$. The evolution equation (33) for v remains unchanged.

The first step in the analysis is to use the evolution equations (28) and (33) for Σ_+ and v to prove that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} v = 0$. The structure of (42)–(45) then allows the limits of $\bar{\Sigma}_+$ and $\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1$ as $\tau \to +\infty$ to be determined, and subsequently the corresponding limits of Σ_+, $\mathcal{R}_1$ and $\mathcal{R}_2$. The main result is contained in the following theorem.

Theorem 1 *Any solution of the system (28)–(34) with* $\Omega > 0$, $\mathcal{R}_1 > 0$ *and* $\mathcal{R}_2 > 0$ *satisfies*

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} (\Sigma_+, \mathcal{R}_1, \mathcal{R}_2, v, M) = (0,0,0,0,0), \tag{46}$$

with

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \frac{\mathcal{R}_1}{M^2} = +\infty \ , \quad \lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{M^2} = +\infty \ . \tag{47}$$

---

[6] We have chosen to write equation (45) with Σ_+ unbarred in the second term, since this form is required in the proof in Appendix A. The factor of $\mathcal{R}_1$ in front of $B_{\bar{\Omega}}$ is crucial, and $\mathcal{R}_2$ has to be written as $(\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1})\mathcal{R}_1$ to produce this factor. We recall from (34) that $-1 \le \frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1} \le 1$.

Proof. The details of the proof are given in Appendix A. ☐

4 Isotropization of radiation-filled models at late times

In this section we will consider the physical implications of Theorem 1 as regards isotropization of the radiation-filled cosmological models with zero cosmological constant. As mentioned in the introduction, the anisotropy can be quantified by the shear parameter Σ and the Weyl parameters. The shear parameter is defined by $\Sigma^2 = \frac{\sigma_{\alpha\beta}\sigma^{\alpha\beta}}{6H^2}$, or equivalently, on account of (1), by

$$\Sigma^2 = \tfrac{1}{6}\Sigma_{\alpha\beta}\Sigma^{\alpha\beta} \ . \tag{48}$$

It follows from (6) and (48) that

$$\Sigma^2 = \Sigma_+^2 + \Sigma_-^2 + \Sigma_\times^2 \ . \tag{49}$$

We define the Weyl parameters $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ by

$$\mathcal{W}_1 = \frac{C_{abcd}C^{abcd}}{48H^4} \ , \quad \mathcal{W}_2 = \frac{C_{abcd}{}^{*}C^{abcd}}{48H^4} \ , \tag{50}$$

or equivalently,

$$\mathcal{W}_1 = \frac{E_{\alpha\beta}E^{\alpha\beta} - H_{\alpha\beta}H^{\alpha\beta}}{6H^4} \ , \quad \mathcal{W}_2 = \frac{E_{\alpha\beta}H^{\alpha\beta}}{3H^4} \ , \tag{51}$$

where $E_{\alpha\beta}$ and $H_{\alpha\beta}$ are respectively the electric and magnetic parts of the Weyl curvature tensor with respect to the congruence orthogonal to the G_3 group orbits (Wainwright and Ellis 1997, page 19). We define the Hubble-normalized components by

$$\mathcal{E}_{\alpha\beta} = \frac{E_{\alpha\beta}}{H^2} \ , \quad \mathcal{H}_{\alpha\beta} = \frac{H_{\alpha\beta}}{H^2} \ , \tag{52}$$

labelling them as with $\Sigma_{\alpha\beta}$ in (6). It follows that

$$\mathcal{W}_1 = \mathcal{E}_+^2 + \mathcal{E}_-^2 + \mathcal{E}_\times^2 - \mathcal{H}_+^2 - \mathcal{H}_-^2 - \mathcal{H}_\times^2 \tag{53}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_2 = 2(\mathcal{E}_+\mathcal{H}_+ + \mathcal{E}_-\mathcal{H}_- + \mathcal{E}_\times\mathcal{H}_\times) \ . \tag{54}$$

They are given by[7]

$$\mathcal{E}_+ = (1+\Sigma_+)\Sigma_+ - (\Sigma_-^2 + \Sigma_\times^2) + 2(N_-^2 + N_\times^2) + \tfrac{1}{2}G_+^{-1}\gamma\Omega v^2 \tag{55}$$

$$\mathcal{E}_- = (1-2\Sigma_+)\Sigma_- + 2N_+N_- \tag{56}$$

$$\mathcal{E}_\times = (1-2\Sigma_+)\Sigma_\times + 2N_+N_\times \tag{57}$$

$$\mathcal{H}_+ = -3(\Sigma_-N_- + \Sigma_\times N_\times) \tag{58}$$

$$\mathcal{H}_- = -3\Sigma_+N_- - 2N_+\Sigma_- \tag{59}$$

$$\mathcal{H}_\times = -3\Sigma_+N_\times - 2N_+\Sigma_\times \ . \tag{60}$$

---

[7] See Wainwright and Ellis 1997, page 35 for the general expression for $E_{\alpha\beta}$ and $H_{\alpha\beta}$. See Lim 2004, page 49 for the expression for the individual components, but note that the components are normalized by $3H^2$ there.

The limits of the anisotropy scalars Σ, $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ as $\tau \to +\infty$ for tilted irrotational radiation-filled Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies are given in the following theorem.

Theorem 2 *For any tilted irrotational radiation-filled Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmology with zero cosmological constant, satisfying $\Omega > 0$, $\mathcal{R}_1 > 0$, $\mathcal{R}_2 > 0$ and $v > 0$, the density parameter satisfies*

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \Omega = 1 \ , \tag{61}$$

the tilt variable v satisfies

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} v = 0 \ , \tag{62}$$

and the anisotropy scalars satisfy

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \Sigma = 0 \ , \quad (\mathcal{W}_1, \mathcal{W}_2) = -\frac{4\mathcal{R}_2}{M^2}\left[(\cos 2\psi, \sin 2\psi) + \mathcal{O}(M)\right] \ , \tag{63}$$

with

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{M^2} = +\infty \ . \tag{64}$$

Proof. It follows from (20), (21) and (49) that

$$\Sigma^2 = \Sigma_+^2 + \tfrac{1}{2}(\mathcal{R}_1 + \mathcal{R}_2 \cos 2\psi) \ . \tag{65}$$

Equations (61), (62) and (63) now follow directly from Theorem 1 and equation (35) for Ω. The asymptotic forms for $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ follow directly from (53)–(60) and the definitions (19)–(22) of M, $\mathcal{R}_1$ and $\mathcal{R}_2$, on noting that the terms containing N_+ are the dominant ones. The limit (64) is part of Theorem 1. □

The limits in Theorem 2 show that *tilted irrotational radiation-filled Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies isotropize with respect to the shear, but not with respect to the Weyl curvature.*

5 Asymptotic solution at late times

In this section we derive the asymptotic form as $\tau \to +\infty$ of the basic variables $(\Sigma_+, \mathcal{R}_1, \mathcal{R}_2, M, v)$, which determine the asymptotic form of the anisotropy scalars. We begin by considering the so-called truncated differential equations for the variables Σ_+, $\mathcal{R}_1$ and v, obtained from (42), (43) and (33) by setting to zero the terms that involve M. We also write $\mathcal{R}_1 = R^2$, since this facilitates the analysis. The resulting differential equations are

$$\hat{\Sigma}_+' = -\hat{\Sigma}_+ + \hat{\Sigma}_+^3 - \hat{R}^2 - \frac{4}{3+\hat{v}^2}(1 - \hat{\Sigma}_+^2 - \hat{R}^2)\hat{v}^2 \tag{66}$$

$$\hat{R}' = \hat{\Sigma}_+(1 + \hat{\Sigma}_+)\hat{R} \tag{67}$$

$$\hat{v}' = \frac{6}{3-\hat{v}^2}(1 - \hat{v}^2)\hat{\Sigma}_+\hat{v} \ , \tag{68}$$

where we use a hat to denote the solutions of the truncated differential equations. In Appendix B we show that the solutions of (66)–(68) exhibit a power law decay to zero. Since M decays to zero exponentially fast (see (149)) it is plausible that the solutions $\bar{\Sigma}_+$, $\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1$ and

v of the full system (42), (43) and (33) will have the same asymptotic form as the solutions of the truncated differential equations (66)–(68). Finally (38) and (39) show that Σ_+ and $\mathcal{R}_1$ have the same decay rates as $\bar{\Sigma}_+$ and $\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1$. An asymptotic expansion for M can most easily be obtained by using the auxiliary variable Z, defined by (122), with Ω given by (35). Knowing the asymptotic expansions for v and Σ_+, and that M decays exponentially (see (149)), we can integrate (125) to obtain an asymptotic expansion for $\bar{Z}$ and hence recover Z from (124). This process introduces another arbitrary constant C_M.

These considerations lead to the following asymptotic form of the basic variables in any tilted Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmology with irrotational radiation fluid. We give the asymptotic expansion for $\mathcal{R}_1$ explicitly in terms of τ, and for the remaining variables in terms of $\mathcal{R}_1$:

$$\mathcal{R}_1 = \frac{1}{2\tau}\left[1 - \frac{1}{2\tau}(1+\tfrac{4}{3}C_v^2)(\ln\tau + C_{\mathcal{R}_1}) + \mathcal{O}\left(\left(\frac{\ln\tau}{\tau}\right)^2\right)\right] , \tag{69}$$

$$v = C_v\mathcal{R}_1\left[1+\mathcal{R}_1+\mathcal{O}(\mathcal{R}_1^2)\right] , \tag{70}$$

$$\Sigma_+ = -\mathcal{R}_1\left[1+2(1+\tfrac{2}{3}C_v^2)\mathcal{R}_1+\mathcal{O}(\mathcal{R}_1^2)\right] , \tag{71}$$

$$M^{-1} = C_M e^{\tau}\mathcal{R}_1\left[1+\tfrac{1}{2}\mathcal{R}_1+\mathcal{O}(\mathcal{R}_1^2)\right] , \tag{72}$$

as $\tau \to +\infty$. Here C_M, C_v and $C_{\mathcal{R}_1}$ are constants that depend on the initial conditions. The asymptotic expansion for $\mathcal{R}_2$ can be obtained directly from (34) and (35). Its leading term is

$$\mathcal{R}_2 = \sqrt{1-\tfrac{16}{9}C_v^2}\;\mathcal{R}_1[1+\mathcal{O}(\mathcal{R}_1)] , \tag{73}$$

which entails the restriction $0 < C_v \leq \frac{3}{4}$.

We note that the asymptotic expansion for Σ_+ also contains a term $C_{\Sigma_+}e^{-\tau}$, and the asymptotic expansion for ψ would contain an additive constant C_ψ. Thus all five constants of integration for the five-dimensional system (28)–(34) have been accounted for, confirming that the asymptotic form above describes the general Bianchi VII$_0$ solution with a radiation fluid source. We can set one of these constants to unity by using the freedom to shift $\tau \to \tau + C$, leaving four essential constants to parametrize the four-dimensional family of orbits in the five-dimensional state space. We also note the flawed argument in NHW (see page 3126), which should be corrected as above.

We now give the asymptotic dependence of the physical quantities of primary interest on the cosmological clock time t, which is related to τ via equation (2). In the present situation the Raychaudhuri equation reads

$$H' = -(1+q)H , \tag{74}$$

(see Hewitt *et al* 2001, equation (A.9)). On account of (27), it assumes the form

$$H' = -(2+\Sigma_+^2+\mathcal{R}_2\cos 2\psi)H . \tag{75}$$

We integrate this equation using (69), (71) and (73), which gives[8]

$$H = \tfrac{1}{2}Ae^{-2\tau}\left[1+\mathcal{O}(\tfrac{1}{\tau})\right] , \tag{76}$$

---

[8] Note that the integration of the exponentially rapidly oscillating term $\mathcal{R}_2\cos 2\psi$ yields a constant.

where A is a constant with dimensions of $(\text{time})^{-1}$, and then use (2) to obtain

$$t = \frac{1}{A} e^{2\tau} \left[1 + \mathcal{O}(\tfrac{1}{\tau})\right] \ . \tag{77}$$

Note that on account of (35), (69) and (71),

$$\Omega = 1 + \mathcal{O}(\tfrac{1}{\tau}) \ , \tag{78}$$

as $\tau \to +\infty$. The energy density ρ can then be determined algebraically through the relation $\Omega = \rho/(3H^2)$.

The desired asymptotic forms, valid for $At \gg 1$, are as follows:

$$H \approx \frac{1}{2t} \ , \quad \rho \approx \frac{3}{4t^2} \ , \quad v \approx \frac{C_v}{\ln(At)} \ , \tag{79}$$

$$\Sigma^2 \approx \frac{1}{2\ln(At)} \left[1 + \sqrt{1 - \tfrac{16}{9}C_v^2} \, \cos 2\psi \right] \ , \tag{80}$$

$$(\mathcal{W}_1, \mathcal{W}_2) \approx -\frac{4C_M^2(At)}{[\ln(At)]^3} \sqrt{1 - \tfrac{16}{9}C_v^2} \, (\cos 2\psi, \sin 2\psi) \ , \tag{81}$$

where

$$\frac{d\psi}{dt} \approx \frac{C_M A}{\sqrt{At}\,\ln(At)} \ . \tag{82}$$

Observe that the tilt constant C_v primarily affects the amplitude of the shear oscillations through (80), while the constant C_M affects how rapidly the shear oscillates through (82), and hence the amplitude of the Weyl curvature scalars $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$.

Although our emphasis in this paper is on the radiation-filled models ($\gamma = \frac{4}{3}$), we also give the asymptotic forms as $\tau \to +\infty$ for the models with $\frac{2}{3} < \gamma < \frac{4}{3}$, which includes the physically important case of dust ($\gamma = 1$), in order to make comparisons. The derivation of these results is an extension of the analysis given in Appendix B of WHU.

For any tilted irrotational perfect fluid Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmology with $1 \leq \gamma < \frac{4}{3}$,

$$v = C_v e^{-2\beta\tau} \left[1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-b\tau})\right] \ , \tag{83}$$

$$\mathcal{R}_1 = C_{\mathcal{R}_1} e^{-2\beta\tau} \left[1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-b\tau})\right] \ , \tag{84}$$

$$\mathcal{R}_2 = \sqrt{C_{\mathcal{R}_1}^2 - \gamma^2 C_v^2}\, e^{-2\beta\tau}[1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-b\tau})] \ , \tag{85}$$

$$\Sigma_+ = -\frac{C_{\mathcal{R}_1}}{1-\beta} e^{-2\beta\tau} \left[1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-b\tau})\right] \ , \tag{86}$$

$$M^{-1} = C_M e^{(1-\beta)\tau} \left[1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-b\tau})\right] \ , \tag{87}$$

as $\tau \to +\infty$, where $\beta = \frac{1}{2}(4 - 3\gamma)$, and C_M, C_v and $C_{\mathcal{R}_1}$ are constants that depend on the initial conditions, with $0 < C_v \leq C_{\mathcal{R}_1}/\gamma$, and b is a positive constant. We note that the asymptotic expansion of Σ_+ also contains a term $C_{\Sigma_+} e^{-\frac{3}{2}(2-\gamma)\tau}$, and the asymptotic expansion for ψ would contain an additive constant C_ψ, giving five constants of integration as in the radiation case.

We now express the asymptotic behaviour of the various physical quantities in terms of clock time t. As in the radiation case we obtain

$$H = \frac{2A}{3\gamma} e^{-\frac{3}{2}\gamma\tau} \left[1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-2\beta\tau})\right] \ , \quad t = \frac{1}{A} e^{\frac{3}{2}\gamma\tau} \left[1 + \mathcal{O}(e^{-2\beta\tau})\right] \ , \tag{88}$$

where A is a constant with dimensions of (time)$^{-1}$.

The desired asymptotic forms, valid for $At \gg 1$, are as follows:

$$H \approx \frac{2}{3\gamma t} \ , \quad \rho \approx \frac{4}{3\gamma^2 t^2} \ , \quad v \approx C_v (At)^{-\frac{2(4-3\gamma)}{3\gamma}} \ , \tag{89}$$

$$\Sigma^2 \approx \tfrac{1}{2}(At)^{-\frac{2(4-3\gamma)}{3\gamma}} \left(C_{\mathcal{R}_1} + \sqrt{C_{\mathcal{R}_1}^2 - \gamma^2 C_v^2}\, \cos 2\psi\right) \ , \tag{90}$$

$$(\mathcal{W}_1, \mathcal{W}_2) \approx -C_M^2 \sqrt{C_{\mathcal{R}_1}^2 - \gamma^2 C_v^2}\, (At)^{\frac{4(\gamma-1)}{\gamma}} (\cos 2\psi, \sin 2\psi) \ , \tag{91}$$

where

$$\psi \approx \frac{2C_M}{3\gamma - 2} (At)^{\frac{3\gamma-2}{3\gamma}}. \tag{92}$$

6 The role of the cosmological constant

In this section we discuss the influence of a cosmological constant $\Lambda > 0$ on the dynamics of tilted irrotational perfect fluid Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies. The evolution equations in Section 2 are modified only by the presence of

$$\Omega_\Lambda \equiv \frac{\Lambda}{3H^2} \tag{93}$$

in (14) and (15) as follows:

$$\Omega = 1 - \Sigma_+^2 - \Sigma_-^2 - \Sigma_\times^2 - N_-^2 - N_\times^2 - \Omega_\Lambda \tag{94}$$

$$q = 2(\Sigma_+^2 + \Sigma_-^2 + \Sigma_\times^2) + \tfrac{1}{2} G_+^{-1} [(3\gamma - 2) + (2 - \gamma) v^2] \Omega - \Omega_\Lambda \ , \tag{95}$$

and Ω_Λ satisfies the evolution equation

$$\Omega_\Lambda' = 2(q + 1)\Omega_\Lambda \ . \tag{96}$$

The expression for the Weyl curvature components is not affected.

Wald's theorem (see Wald 1983) makes a strong and general statement about the asymptotic behaviour of spatially homogeneous cosmologies with $\Lambda > 0$ and subject to the stress-energy tensor satisfying a physically reasonably energy condition. The result is that the models are asymptotic to the de Sitter solution, in the sense that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \Omega_\Lambda = 1 \ , \tag{97}$$

in our notation. It follows immediately from (97), (14), (49) and (15) that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} (\Sigma_+,\ \Sigma_-,\ \Sigma_\times,\ N_-,\ N_\times) = 0 \ , \tag{98}$$

and hence that

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty}\Omega = 0\ ,\quad \lim_{\tau\to+\infty}\Sigma = 0\ ,\quad \lim_{\tau\to+\infty} q = -1\ . \tag{99}$$

Wald's theorem gives no information about the Weyl parameters or about the tilt v. However it follows from (99) and (10) that

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} N_+ = 0\ , \tag{100}$$

which implies, on account of (53)–(60), that

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty}\mathcal{W}_1 = 0\ ,\quad \lim_{\tau\to+\infty}\mathcal{W}_2 = 0\ . \tag{101}$$

A significant difference occurs as regards the tilt. It follows from Section III of Lim *et al* 2004 that

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} v = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } \frac{2}{3} < \gamma < \frac{4}{3} \\ v_\infty & \text{if } \gamma = \frac{4}{3}\ , \end{cases} \tag{102}$$

where $0 \leq v_\infty \leq 1$, i.e. the value of γ for a radiation fluid ($\gamma = \frac{4}{3}$) is a bifurcation value for the tilt in a model with a cosmological constant.

7 Discussion

In this paper we have derived the late-time dynamical behaviour of tilted Bianchi VII_0 cosmologies with an irrotational radiation fluid as source, and have given the asymptotic form of the general solution as $t \to +\infty$.

The main result is Theorem 1, which establishes rigorously the asymptotic behaviour of the cosmological models.[9] Theorem 2, which is an immediate consequence of Theorem 1, describes the degree to which the models isotropize. These theorems generalize the results of NHW for the corresponding non-tilted models. The derivation of the detailed asymptotic form of the solutions as $t \to +\infty$, given in Section 5, is not completely rigorous, since it relies on the analysis of a so-called truncated system of differential equations, as in NHW.

This class of models displays several noteworthy features. Firstly, the models appear to approximate the flat FL model at late times, since the Hubble-normalized shear and the tilt tend to zero, and the density parameter tends to one. The Hubble-normalized Weyl curvature scalars $\mathcal{W}_1$ and $\mathcal{W}_2$ diverge, however, indicating that physically significant anisotropy remains. In effect, the models isotropize as regards shear and tilt, but not as regards Weyl curvature. The scalars $\mathcal{W}_1$, $\mathcal{W}_2$, which are defined by equations (50) and (51), diverge and oscillate increasingly rapidly in an out-of-phase manner (see equation (81)). The scalar $\mathcal{W}$, defined by

$$\mathcal{W}^2 = \mathcal{W}_1^2 + \mathcal{W}_2^2, \tag{103}$$

then satisfies

$$\lim_{t\to+\infty}\mathcal{W} = +\infty\ , \tag{104}$$

as follows from (63) and (64). Thus, in terms of Hubble-normalized scalars, the future asymptotic state ($t \to +\infty$) for a radiation-filled universe is given by

---

[9] The assumption $\mathcal{R}_2 > 0$ of Theorem 1 is supported numerically (see paragraph before (37)).

$$\Sigma \to 0 \ , \quad v \to 0 \ , \quad \Omega \to 1 \ , \quad \mathcal{W} \to \infty \ . \tag{105}$$

Secondly, the isotropization as regards shear and tilt occurs at a slow rate, i.e. Σ^2 and v tend to zero logarithmically in terms of clock time t (proportional to $\frac{1}{\ln(At)}$, see equations (79) and (80)).

The dust-filled ($\gamma = 1$) universes differ significantly. The Weyl curvature scalar $\mathcal{W}$ remains bounded and approaches a finite value $\mathcal{W}_\infty$ that depends on the initial conditions (see equation (91) with $\gamma = 1$). Thus, in terms of Hubble-normalized scalars, the future asymptotic state for a dust-filled universe is given by

$$\Sigma \to 0 \ , \quad v \to 0 \ , \quad \Omega \to 1 \ , \quad \mathcal{W} \to \mathcal{W}_\infty \ . \tag{106}$$

The isotropization as regards shear and tilt occurs at a faster rate, i.e. Σ^2 and v tend to zero like $(At)^{-2/3}$ (see equation (90) with $\gamma = 1$). We note in passing that a universe described by (106), i.e. one that is highly isotropic as regards the shear but not as regards the Weyl curvature, is compatible with the observed highly isotropic temperature of the cosmic microwave background radiation (see WHU, Section 4, for further discussion of this point).[10]

As shown in Section 5, the dominance of the Weyl curvature at late times is curbed by the presence of a positive cosmological constant (see equation (98)), i.e. the Weyl scalar $\mathcal{W}$ tends to zero. Thus, in terms of Hubble-normalized scalars, the future asymptotic state ($t \to +\infty$) for a universe with a cosmological constant and radiation or dust, is

$$\Sigma \to 0 \ , \quad v \to v_\infty \ , \quad \Omega_\Lambda \to 1 \ , \quad \Omega \to 0 \ , \quad \mathcal{W} \to 0 \ , \tag{107}$$

with $v_\infty = 0$ for dust and $0 \leq v_\infty \leq 1$ for radiation. The asymptotic states (105) or (106) with $\Lambda = 0$ are still of relevance for models with $\Lambda > 0$ since they can act as intermediate states, i.e. *a model with* $\Lambda > 0$ *can be approximated arbitrarily closely by the states (105) or (106) over a finite time interval.*

In conclusion, we note that the most striking feature of the late-time dynamics of Bianchi VII$_0$ cosmologies with a radiation fluid is the so-called *Weyl curvature dominance*: if the cosmological constant is zero ($\Lambda = 0$) then the Hubble-normalized Weyl scalar $\mathcal{W}$ diverges as $t \to +\infty$, while if $\Lambda > 0$, the scalar $\mathcal{W}$ can become arbitrarily large during a finite time interval. The phenomenon was first encountered for non-tilted Bianchi VII$_0$ models (see WHU), and in this paper we have shown that it persists in the presence of tilt, for an irrotational fluid. The same phenomenon has recently been found in Bianchi VII$_0$ models with a tilted and rotating fluid (Hervik *et al* 2006). Weyl curvature dominance also occurs in non-tilted Bianchi VIII cosmologies (Horwood *et al* 2003), and has recently been found in tilted Bianchi VIII cosmologies (Hervik & Lim 2006).

---

[10] Dominance of the Weyl curvature may lead to other observable effects, such as image distortion (see, e.g., Chrobok & Perlick 2001.

Acknowledgements

We thank Sigbjørn Hervik, Robert van den Hoogen, Alan Coley and Henk van Elst for discussions. This work was supported by NSERC through an Undergraduate Student Research Award (RJD) and a Discovery Grant (JW).

A Proof of Theorem 1

In the proof we need the following standard result and a second lemma.

Lemma 1 *Let $f(\tau)$ be a non-negative real-valued and Lipschitz continuous function on the interval $\tau_0 \leq \tau < +\infty$. If*

$$\int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} f(\tau)\, d\tau \quad \textit{is finite}$$

then $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} f(\tau) = 0$.

Lemma 2 *For solutions of equations (28)–(36), the following limits cannot both hold:*

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \Omega = 0 \ , \quad \lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \Sigma_+ = \alpha \ , \quad 0 \leq \alpha < 1. \tag{108}$$

Proof. Suppose that both hold. Then (35) implies that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \mathcal{R}_1 = 1 - \alpha^2$. It follows from (38) and (41) that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \bar{\Sigma}_+ = \alpha$, $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \bar{\Omega} = 0$. Then (37) and (38) imply that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \bar{\Sigma}'_+ = -(1+\alpha)(1-\alpha^2) \neq 0$, which contradicts $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \bar{\Sigma}_+ = \alpha$. □

We begin by proving that

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} v = 0 \ , \tag{109}$$

using the evolution equations for Σ_+ and v in the form (28) and (33), which we repeat for convenience:

$$\Sigma'_+ = -(2-q)\Sigma_+ - (N_-^2 + N_\times^2) - \frac{4\Omega}{3+v^2}v^2 \tag{110}$$

$$v' = \frac{6}{3-v^2}\Sigma_+(1-v^2)v \ . \tag{111}$$

Equation (110) implies that if $\Sigma_+(\tau_0) = 0$ for some τ_0, then $\Sigma'_+(\tau_0) < 0$, and $\Sigma_+ < 0$ for $\tau > \tau_0$. We conclude that

$$\text{the sign of } \Sigma_+ \text{ is fixed eventually.} \tag{112}$$

Hence v is monotone eventually and since it is also bounded,

$$\lim_{\tau\to\infty} v = L \ , \tag{113}$$

where $0 \leq L \leq 1$. Hence

$$\int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} v'\, d\tau \quad \text{is finite.} \tag{114}$$

It follows from (110)–(111) that v'' is bounded, which implies that v' is Lipschitz continuous. We thus conclude from Lemma 1 that

$$\lim_{\tau\to\infty} v' = 0 \ . \tag{115}$$

We want to show that $L = 0$. To do this we assume the contrary, namely that $0 < L \leq 1$.

Case 1: $L = 1$
Since $v \leq 1$ and is monotone eventually then v is eventually increasing. Hence $\Sigma_+ > 0$ eventually by (111) and (112). It follows from (110) that $\Sigma_+' < 0$, hence Σ_+ is monotone decreasing eventually, and so

$$\lim_{\tau\to\infty} \Sigma_+ = \alpha \ , \quad 0 \leq \alpha < 1 \ . \tag{116}$$

It follows that

$$\int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} \Sigma_+' \ d\tau \quad \text{is finite.} \tag{117}$$

Since $\Sigma_+ > 0$ and $L \neq 0$ it follows from (110) that

$$\Omega \leq (-\Sigma_+') \left(\frac{3+v^2}{4v^2} \right) \leq C(-\Sigma_+') \quad \text{for } \tau \geq \tau_0, \tag{118}$$

where C is a positive constant, and τ_0 is sufficiently large. We conclude that $\int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} \Omega \ d\tau$ is finite. Since Ω' is bounded by (36), Ω is Lipschitz continuous, and it follows from Lemma 1 that

$$\lim_{\tau\to\infty} \Omega = 0 \ . \tag{119}$$

By Lemma 2 we have a contradiction.

Case 2: $0 < L < 1$
It follows from (111), (113) and (115) that $\lim_{\tau\to\infty} \Sigma_+ = 0$, and by integrating (111) it follows that $\int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} \Sigma_+ \ d\tau$ is finite. Since $L > 0$, it follows from (110) that

$$\Omega \leq -[\Sigma_+' + (2-q)\Sigma_+] \left(\frac{3+v^2}{4v^2} \right) \leq -C[\Sigma_+' + (2-q)\Sigma_+] \quad \text{for } \tau \geq \tau_0, \tag{120}$$

where C is a positive constant, and τ_0 is sufficiently large. Since $2-q$ is bounded, we conclude that $\int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} \Omega \ d\tau$ is finite. The rest of the proof is the same as case 1.

To summarize, we have established that (109) holds. The next step is to show that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \Omega$ exists. Extending the method used in Appendix A of NHW we integrate (45) to obtain

$$\frac{1}{2} \ln \frac{\bar{\Omega}}{\bar{\Omega}_0} = \int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} \bar{\Sigma}_+^2 \ d\tau + \int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} \frac{4\Sigma_+ v^2}{3+v^2} \ d\tau + \int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} M \mathcal{R}_1 B_{\bar{\Omega}} \ d\tau \ , \tag{121}$$

where $\bar{\Omega}_0 = \bar{\Omega}(\tau_0)$ and the initial time is chosen such that $M \leq 1$ for all $\tau \geq \tau_0$.

Following Section 3 of NHW, we introduce an auxiliary variable Z according to

$$Z = \frac{M\mathcal{R}_1}{\sqrt{\Omega}} \; , \tag{122}$$

whose evolution equation is

$$Z' = \left[-1 - 2(1+\Sigma_+)\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1}\cos 2\psi - 3\mathcal{R}_2 M \sin 2\psi - \frac{4v^2}{3+v^2}\Sigma_+ \right] Z \; , \tag{123}$$

as follows from (29), (31) and (36). We modify Z according to

$$\bar{Z} = \frac{Z}{1 - \frac{1}{2}M(1+\Sigma_+)\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1}\sin 2\psi} \; , \tag{124}$$

and obtain

$$\bar{Z}' = \left[-1 - \frac{4\Sigma_+ v^2}{3+v^2} + MB_{\bar{Z}} \right] \bar{Z} \; . \tag{125}$$

Since v and M tend to zero as $\tau \to +\infty$, equation (125) implies that

$$\bar{Z} = \mathcal{O}(e^{(-1+\delta)\tau}) \tag{126}$$

where δ can be chosen arbitrarily small. Equation (122) and (124) then imply that

$$M\mathcal{R}_1 = \mathcal{O}(e^{(-1+\delta)\tau}) \quad \text{and hence} \int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} M\mathcal{R}_1 B_{\bar{\Omega}} \, d\tau \quad \text{is finite.} \tag{127}$$

From (111) we obtain

$$\frac{4\Sigma_+ v^2}{3+v^2} = \frac{2(3-v^2)vv'}{3(3+v^2)(1-v^2)} = f'(v) \; , \tag{128}$$

where $f(v) = \frac{1}{6}\ln\frac{(3+v^2)^3}{(1-v^2)}$, and hence the second integral in (121) is given by

$$\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} \frac{4\Sigma_+ v^2}{3+v^2} \, d\tau = f(v) - f(v_0) \; , \tag{129}$$

where $v_0 = v(\tau_0)$. It follows from (109) that

$$\int_{\tau_0}^{\infty} \frac{4\Sigma_+ v^2}{3+v^2} \, d\tau \quad \text{is finite.} \tag{130}$$

We have thus shown that the second and third integral terms in (121) are bounded at late times. Since Ω is bounded above, it follows from (121) that

$$I(\tau) := \int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} \bar{\Sigma}_+^2 \, d\tau \quad \text{is bounded above for all } \tau \geq \tau_0. \tag{131}$$

Since the integrand $\bar{\Sigma}_+^2$ is non-negative, the function $I(\tau)$ is monotonically increasing, which implies that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} I(\tau)$ exists and is finite. It follows from (121), (127) and (130) that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \bar{\Omega}$ exists, and hence from (41) that $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty} \Omega$ exists, i.e. there is a constant L, satisfying $0 \leq L \leq 1$ such that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \Omega = L \ . \tag{132}$$

The next step is to show that Σ_+ and $\mathcal{R}_1$ tend to zero and that $L = 1$. Since $\bar{\Sigma}_+$ and $\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1$ are bounded, it follows from (42) that $(\bar{\Sigma}_+^2)' = 2\bar{\Sigma}_+\bar{\Sigma}_+'$ is uniformly bounded for $\tau \geq \tau_0$. This implies that $\bar{\Sigma}_+^2$ is Lipschitz continuous for $\tau \geq \tau_0$. It thus follows from (131) and Lemma 1 that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \bar{\Sigma}_+ = 0 \ , \tag{133}$$

and hence, from (38) and (37), that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \Sigma_+ = 0 \ . \tag{134}$$

It now follows from (35), (39), (37), (132) and (134) that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \mathcal{R}_1 = \lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \bar{\mathcal{R}}_1 = 1 - L \ . \tag{135}$$

The limits (37), (109), (133), (135) and equation (42) imply that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \bar{\Sigma}_+' = L - 1 \ , \tag{136}$$

which contradicts (133) unless $L = 1$. Using (135) we obtain

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \mathcal{R}_1 = 0 \ . \tag{137}$$

It follows from (34) and (109) that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \mathcal{R}_2 = 0 \ . \tag{138}$$

Next, we will show that $M^2/\mathcal{R}_1$ tends to zero. We note that (43)–(44) give

$$\left(\frac{\bar{M}^2}{\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1}\right)' = -2\left[1 + 3\bar{\Sigma}_+ + 2\bar{\Sigma}_+^2 + M(B_{\bar{M}} + B_{\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1})\right]\frac{\bar{M}^2}{\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1} \ . \tag{139}$$

It then follows from (133) and (37) that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \frac{\bar{M}^2}{\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1} = 0 \ , \tag{140}$$

and hence that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \frac{M^2}{\mathcal{R}_1} = 0 \ , \quad \text{or equivalently} \quad \lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \frac{\mathcal{R}_1}{M^2} = +\infty \ . \tag{141}$$

It remains to show that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{M^2} = +\infty \ . \tag{142}$$

Equation (33) can be written in the form

$$V' = 2\Sigma_+ V \ , \tag{143}$$

where

$$V = \frac{v}{(1-v^2)^{\frac{1}{3}}} \ . \tag{144}$$

Let

$$Y = \frac{V}{\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1} \ . \tag{145}$$

It follows from (38), (43) and (143) that

$$Y' = -2(\bar{\Sigma}_+^2 + MB)Y, \tag{146}$$

where B is bounded as $\tau \to +\infty$. This equation can be integrated to yield

$$Y = Y_0 e^{-\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} \bar{\Sigma}_+^2 \, d\tau} e^{-\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} MB \, d\tau} \ . \tag{147}$$

We know that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} \bar{\Sigma}_+^2 \, d\tau \quad \text{is finite.} \tag{148}$$

In addition equations (44), (40) and (133) imply that

$$M = \mathcal{O}(e^{(-1+\delta)\tau}), \quad \text{as } \tau \to +\infty, \tag{149}$$

where δ is an arbitrarily small positive number. It thus follows from (145) and (147)–(149) that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \frac{V}{\bar{\mathcal{R}}_1} = C \ , \tag{150}$$

which, with equations (143), (39) and (37), implies that

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \frac{v}{\mathcal{R}_1} = C \ . \tag{151}$$

We now write (34) in the form

$$1 - \left(\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1}\right)^2 = \left(\frac{4\Omega}{3+v^2}\right)^2 \left(\frac{v}{\mathcal{R}_1}\right)^2 \ . \tag{152}$$

It follows from (134), (137) and (35) that $\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \Omega = 1$. Equation (151) thus implies

$$\lim_{\tau \to +\infty} \left(\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1}\right)^2 = 1 - \tfrac{16}{9} C^2 \ , \tag{153}$$

which is non-zero in general. Finally, since

$$\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{M^2} = \left(\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{\mathcal{R}_1}\right) \left(\frac{\mathcal{R}_1}{M^2}\right) \tag{154}$$

it follows from (141) that

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty}\frac{\mathcal{R}_2}{M^2}=+\infty\ . \tag{155}$$

□

B Derivation of decay rates

In this Appendix we use centre manifold theory (see for example, Carr 1981, and NHW, Appendix B, for a brief summary) to derive the asymptotic decay rates of solutions of equations (66)–(68) as $\tau\to+\infty$. The equilibrium point $(\hat{\Sigma}_+,\hat{R},\hat{v})=(0,0,0)$ is asymptotically stable, but non-hyperbolic, having two zero eigenvalues (those associated with $\hat{R}$ and $\hat{v}$). There is thus a two-dimensional centre manifold of the form

$$\hat{\Sigma}_+=h(\hat{R},\hat{v}). \tag{156}$$

Using the method summarized in NHW, Appendix B, we find the following first order approximation to the centre manifold:

$$\hat{\Sigma}_+=-\hat{R}^2-\tfrac{4}{3}\hat{v}^2+\{\text{higher order terms}\}\ . \tag{157}$$

To determine the asymptotic behaviour on the centre manifold, we observe that (68) can be written as

$$V'=2\hat{\Sigma}_+V\ ,\quad V=\frac{\hat{v}}{(1-\hat{v}^2)^{1/3}}\ , \tag{158}$$

which gives

$$V(\tau)=V(\tau_0)\exp\left[\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau}2\hat{\Sigma}_+(s)\ ds\right]\ . \tag{159}$$

Since $\lim_{\tau\to+\infty}V(\tau)=0$, we obtain

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty}\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau}\hat{\Sigma}_+(s)\ ds=-\infty\ . \tag{160}$$

Now observe that (67) gives

$$\hat{R}(\tau)=\hat{R}(\tau_0)\exp\left[\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau}\hat{\Sigma}_+\ ds\right]\exp\left[\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau}\hat{\Sigma}_+^2\ ds\right]\ , \tag{161}$$

where the second exponential term is greater than unity, since the integrand $\hat{\Sigma}_+^2$ is positive. Hence

$$\frac{V}{\hat{R}^2}=\frac{V(\tau_0)}{\hat{R}(\tau_0)^2}\exp\left[-2\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau}\hat{\Sigma}_+^2\ ds\right] \tag{162}$$

and

$$\lim_{\tau\to+\infty}\frac{V}{\hat{R}^2}=C\ , \tag{163}$$

i.e. the limit exists, but could be zero. In other words, $\hat{v} = \mathcal{O}(\hat{R}^2)$. So the first order approximation of the centre manifold (157) becomes

$$\hat{\Sigma}_+ = -\hat{R}^2 + \{\text{higher order terms}\} \ . \tag{164}$$

We can use this information to integrate (67), obtaining

$$\hat{R}^2 = \frac{1}{2\tau} + \{\text{higher order terms}\} \ , \tag{165}$$

and so

$$\hat{\Sigma}_+^2 = \frac{1}{4\tau^2} + o\left(\frac{1}{\tau^2}\right) \ , \tag{166}$$

which leads to

$$\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} \hat{\Sigma}_+^2 \ ds = C - \frac{1}{4\tau} + o\left(\frac{1}{\tau}\right) = C - \tfrac{1}{2}\hat{R}^2 + o(\hat{R}^2) \ , \tag{167}$$

where C is a positive constant. Hence from (158) and (162) we obtain

$$\hat{v} = C_v(\hat{R}^2 + \hat{R}^4) + o(\hat{R}^4) \ , \tag{168}$$

where C_v is an arbitrary constant. We can now reapply the centre manifold procedure to amend (157) by including higher order terms that are comparable to $\hat{v}^2$:

$$\hat{\Sigma}_+ = -\hat{R}^2 - 2\hat{R}^4 - \tfrac{4}{3}\hat{v}^2 + \{\text{higher order terms}\} \ . \tag{169}$$

We then solve (67) to obtain

$$\hat{R} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\tau}}\left[1 - \frac{(1 + \frac{4}{3}C_v^2)(\ln\tau + C_{\mathcal{R}_1})}{4\tau} + o(\tau^{-1})\right] \ , \tag{170}$$

and substitute into (168) and (157) to give the asymptotic form of $\hat{v}$ and $\hat{\Sigma}_+$. The error bound $o(\tau^{-1})$ can be improved to $\mathcal{O}((\frac{\ln\tau}{\tau})^2)$, by increasing the accuracy of the centre manifold approximation (see NHW, page 3132).

References

[1] Carr J 1981 *Application of Centre Manifold Theory* (New York: Springer)

[2] Chrobok T and Perlick V 2001 Classification of image distortions in terms of Petrov types *Class. Quantum Grav.* **18** 3059–3079

[3] Coley A and Hervik S 2005 A dynamical systems approach to the tilted Bianchi models of solvable type *Class. Quantum Grav.* **22** 579–605

[4] Ellis G F R and MacCallum M A H 1969 A class of homogeneous cosmological models *Commun. Math. Phys.* **12** 108–141

[5] Hervik S and Lim W C 2006 The late-time behaviour of vortic Bianchi type VIII universes Accepted by *Class. Quantum Grav.*

[6] Hervik S, van den Hoogen R J, Lim W C and Coley A A 2006 The futures of Bianchi type VII_0 cosmologies with vorticity *Class. Quantum Grav.* **23** 845–866

[7] Hewitt C G, Bridson R and Wainwright J 2001 The asymptotic regimes of tilted Bianchi II cosmologies *Gen. Rel. Grav.* **33** 65–94

[8] Horwood J T, Hancock M J, The D and Wainwright J 2003 Late-time asymptotic dynamics of Bianchi VIII cosmologies *Class. Quantum Grav.* **20** 1757–1778

[9] King A R and Ellis G F R 1973 Tilted homogeneous cosmological models *Commun. Math. Phys.* **31** 209–242

[10] Lim W C 2004 PhD thesis, University of Waterloo, gr-qc/0410126

[11] Lim W C, van Elst H, Uggla C and Wainwright J 2004 Asymptotic isotropization in inhomogeneous cosmology *Phys. Rev. D* **69** 103507

[12] Nilsson U S, Hancock M J and Wainwright J 2000 Non-tilted Bianchi VII_0 models–the radiation fluid *Class. Quantum Grav.* **17** 3119–3134

[13] Wainwright J and Ellis G F R (ed) 1997 *Dynamical Systems in Cosmology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)

[14] Wainwright J, Hancock M J and Uggla C 1999 Asymptotic self-similarity breaking at late times in cosmology *Class. Quantum Grav.* **16** 2577–2598

[15] Wald R M 1983 Asymptotic behaviour of homogeneous cosmological models in the presence of a positive cosmological constant *Phys. Rev. D* **28** 2118–2120